

A. Zholdubayeva^{1*}, S. Aubakirova², M. Manassova³

¹Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Kazakhstan, Almaty

²Non-Commercial JSC «Toraigyrov University», Kazakhstan, Pavlodar

³Karaganda University named after E.A. Buketov, Kazakhstan, Karaganda

*e-mail: ajulazh@gmail.com

ON THE THEORETICAL AND METHODOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE STUDY OF SECULAR AND CONFESSONAL EDUCATION

The article analyzes the qualitative and temporal configuration of secular and confessional education with the allocation of positive aspects and critical points. According to the authors, a comparative analysis of the theoretical and methodological foundations of the educational models under consideration acts as a platform for understanding the pedagogical experience as a whole, and provides for the selection of a wide variety of options analyzed in close relationship with the genesis of culture, science, and social thought. Carrying out a study of the particular specifics of the functioning of models of secular and confessional education implemented in various world educational practices, the authors came to the conclusion that there is a kind of “coordinate system” that determines the nature of existing models. This coordinate system includes the historical specifics of the existing relationships between state institutions and religious associations; the peculiarities of national and cultural traditions of modern European countries and Kazakhstan; the role and place of religious values in the life of the people; the nature of legal regulation in the field of educational practices of secular and religious institutions.

Key words: education, secular model of education, confessional model of education, dialogue of cultures.

А. Жолдубаева^{1*}, С. Аубакирова², М. Манасова³

¹Әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Қазақстан, Алматы қ.

²«Торайғыров университеті» КеАҚ, Қазақстан, Павлодар қ.

³«Бөкетов атындағы Қарағанды университеті» КеАҚ, Қазақстан, Қарағанды қ.

*e-mail: ajulazh@gmail.com

Зайырлы және конфессиялық білім беруді зерттеудің теориялық-әдіснамалық негіздері туралы мәселелер

Мақалада зайырлы және конфессиялық білімнің сапалық және уақытша конфигурациясына талдау жасалып, оң аспектілері мен сыни тұстары көрсетілген. Авторлардың пікірінше, қарастырылып отырған білім беру үлгілерінің теориялық және әдістемелік негіздерін салыстырмалы талдау жалпы педагогикалық тәжірибені түсінудің тұғырнамасы ретінде қызмет етеді және мәдениет, ғылым, қоғамдық ой генезисімен тығыз байланыста талданатын көптеген нұсқаларды таңдауды қамтамасыз етеді. Өртүрлі әлемдік білім беру тәжірибелерінде жүзеге асырылатын зайырлы және конфессиялық білім беру үлгілерінің қызмет ету ерекшеліктерін зерттеуді жүзеге асыра отырып, авторлар қазіргі білім берудің сипатын анықтайтын өзіндік модельдер «координаталық жүйе» бар деген қорытындыға келді. Бұл координаттар жүйесіне мыналар кіреді: мемлекет пен діни бірлестіктер арасындағы қарым-қатынастың тарихи қалыптасқан түрі; елдің ұлттық-мәдени ерекшеліктері; дәстүрлі діни құндылықтардың халық өміріндегі рөлі; құқықтық жүйелердің ерекшеліктері; әлеуметтік және конфессиялық топтар санының пайызы.

Түйін сөздер: білім беру, білім берудің зайырлы моделі, білім берудің конфессиялық моделі, мәдениеттер диалогы.

А. Жолдубаева^{1*}, С. Аубакирова², М. Манасова³

¹Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Казахстан, г. Алматы

²НАО «Торайгыров университет», Казахстан, г. Павлодар

³НАО «Карагандинский университет им. Букетова», Казахстан, г. Караганда

*e-mail: ajulazh@gmail.com

К вопросу о теоретико-методологических основаниях исследования светского и конфессионального образования

В статье осуществлен анализ качественно-временной конфигурации светского и конфессионального образования с выделением положительных аспектов и критических точек. По мнению авторов, сравнительный анализ теоретико-методологических оснований рассматриваемых об-

разовательных моделей выступает платформой осмысления педагогического опыта в целом и обеспечивает выделение широкого разнообразия вариантов, анализируемых в тесной взаимосвязи с генезисом культуры, науки, общественной мысли. Осуществляя исследование конкретной специфики функционирования моделей светского и конфессионального образования, реализованных в различных мировых образовательных практиках, авторы пришли к выводу о наличии своеобразной «системы координат», определяющей характер существующих моделей. Данная система координат включает историческую специфику сложившихся взаимоотношений между государственными институциями и религиозными объединениями; особенности национально-культурных традиций современных европейских стран и Казахстана; роль и место религиозных ценностных установок в жизни народа; характер правового регулирования в области образовательных практик светских и религиозных учреждений.

Ключевые слова: образование, светская модель образования, конфессиональная модель образования, диалог культур.

Main part

Actualization of the historical and culturological foundations of certain educational models in different countries makes it possible to consider in full the achievements, contradictions, difficulties of changing the forms and content of education, which incorporate the logic of a particular community, due to the socio-cultural situation developing in them.

It is possible to characterize the difference between the philosophical attitudes and historical and cultural factors of secular education, which is formed on the basis of anthropocentrism, and confessional education, which is formed on the basis of theocentrism, by identifying common grounds for differentiation. A comparative analysis of educational systems allows us to highlight a wide variety of options that are analyzed in close relationship with the genesis of culture, science, social thought, which are formed on the basis of different priorities and thus allow us to highlight the main cultural and historical foundations of secular and confessional education.

The question of the place of religion in the educational field, the content and forms of its representation in the educational process, as well as the goals and objectives of education, somehow correlating religious issues, is the subject of wide discussion [Pisenko, 2017; Babich 2017; Gurin, 2017, Jarvis, 2013, etc.]. The need for the presence of doctrinal traditions in the educational process the field, according to various researchers, representatives of civil society, political figures, is determined by the very specifics of modern socio-political conditions. Such conditions include the existing internal contradictions of the multiculturalism vector, controversial and sometimes very contradictory attitudes towards migrant communities, issues determined by integra-

tion migrant flows, conflicts erupting everywhere on national and religious differences, and so on.

In addition, the problem of religion in the educational space, and in general, confessional education in educational practice, is actualized due to the importance of the tasks of educating the citizenship of the population, the development of knowledge competencies in the field of human rights and freedoms, peaceful coexistence of various communities and social integrations, global problems and intercultural dialogue. It is no accident that the German culturologist A. Hazenclever emphasized the importance of the value-worldview correlation of religious education and the democratic behavior of community members. Moreover, as A. notes. Hasenclever, in the presence of a low level of religious awareness and religious enlightenment, there is a danger of using this factor as a method of aggressive political manipulation [Hasenclever, 2003:304].

The issues of interaction between secular and religious educational practices in various countries are determined by the nature of historical value orientations, the specifics and level of development of multicultural traditions in society, the peculiarities of socio-political and economic institutional models of society, the legislatively formalized nature of state-confessional actions that determine the vector of development of educational traditions in general, the fullness and structurality of secular and confessional educational practices, in particular.

Without being distracted by the detailed disclosure of historical, scientific, philosophical, religious and theological aspects of the secularism of the state and the state education system, we will highlight a number of important international documents that legislatively determine the nature of the relationship that develops between the state and a particular religious organization: the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), the International Covenant

on Civil and Political Rights (1966), the Final Act of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (1975), the Charter of Paris for a New Europe (1990).

The position of the international community on this topic is most fully expressed in the Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief, adopted by the UN. The provision of the above-mentioned Declaration can be defined in the following words: every child, regardless of place of residence, race or ethnicity, has the right to access education that provides him with knowledge in the religious sphere; and vice versa, if there is no interest in religious topics, this child cannot be forced to study in the religious sphere. This Declaration emphasizes the need for the guiding principle of prioritizing the interests of the child [UN General Assembly Resolution 36/55, 1981, Article 5, paragraph 2].

At the same time, international documents do not contain any recommendations regarding the theoretical and methodological aspects of the introduction and development of secular and confessional education. That is why the UN Commission on Human Rights, considering the issue of the human right to receive secular and religious education, noted that it does not propose a single universal document that defines in detail the forms of exercising this right, its provisions are only recommendatory character. At the same time, the UN document notes, the legislation on education in each country should take into account both the tradition and the current state of the problem in its country.

Based on the analysis of the use of the concept of “secular nature of education” and its interpretations in modern scientific literature, we came to the conclusion that they all gravitate towards two main positions.

The first position is to bring to the fore the requirements for the content of education, i.e. to what is actually being studied, what knowledge is taught and mastered. The second position is characterized mainly by bringing to the fore the requirements for the organization of the educational process - for how the study of religion is organized. Of course, both of these positions are interrelated. Understanding what knowledge students should master is related to how the educational process itself should be organized.

Today, the most common statement is that in secular education there can be neither atheistic nor apologetic study of religion, the so-called principle of ideological neutrality [The place of religious education in spiritual and moral education,

2016]. Those. the goal of secular education is to gain knowledge about various religious beliefs and practices from an objective and impartial point of view, free from apologetics and the development of an evaluative attitude towards it. Often this demand for a neutral attitude towards all religions is accompanied by the demand for equal representation of all religions in the educational process. However, in our opinion, the above understanding of secular education conflicts with the basic principle of cultural conformity of education, with the task of integrating the student’s personality into the national culture, which is directly formulated in the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education.” Ch. 3. Article 11].

Having considered the existing in the scientific literature and logically possible formulations of the principle of the secular nature of education [On understanding the secularism of the state and the secular nature of education in public schools, 2017; Ponkin, 2003; Bratanovsky, Kocherga, 2017], we come to the conclusion that the following interpretation is the most accurate, logical, corresponding to historical tradition and modern social practice secular education:

The secular activities of educational institutions, firstly, are focused on a positive and scientific discussion of tasks whose importance affects the whole society as a whole; secondly, the construction of secular activities of educational institutions is determined by the understanding of democracy, citizenship, humanism as the main priorities of universal moral regulators; thirdly, the content of secular activities of educational institutions takes into account the importance of comprehensive free personal development of each individual; Fourth, the secular activities of educational institutions are organized and supported by social institutions through State authorities and local self-government.

It is in this connotation that the specifics of secular activities of educational institutions are determined by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” (Chapter 4 of Article 13 “The concept of the content of education”), which asserts the obligation to organize and conduct secular education, taking into account legal norms and requirements of state educational standards. At the same time, it should be emphasized that the article 13 under consideration, “The concept of the content of education”, simultaneously determines the importance of taking into account the ideological broadcasts of various knowledge and value worldviews, the speci-

ficity of various lifestyles.

Going deeper into the analysis of the specific specifics of the functioning of models of secular education that take place in various world practices, we came to the conclusion that there is a kind of “coordinate system” that determines the nature of existing models:

- a model of historically established correlation practices between the state and religious entities;
- a model that sets the vector of development of the national and cultural characteristics of the country;
- a model that forms the features of traditional religious attitudes recognized and carried out by members of the community;
- the specifics of legal systems, the percentage ratio of the number of social and confessional groups.

In connection with the above, let us turn to the world practice of state educational institutions of democratic European states in solving issues of the legal connotation of teaching disciplines that include religious and religious components.

The first example we should turn to is the Greek Constitution. Here we emphasize that the first words, the so-called epigraph of the Constitution, sound as follows: “In the name of the Holy, Consubstantial and Indivisible Trinity,” thereby defining itself as a religious, in this case a religious state. Article 3.1 of the Greek Constitution defines Christian Orthodoxy as the dominant religion, according to which the formation and instilling of religious moral values in students of educational institutions acts as a state task. Further, article 16.2 of the same document defines, firstly, the importance of education as a priority task of the state, and, secondly, the purpose of such education is aimed at improving the spiritual, moral, physical and professional competencies of members of society, improving the level of development of religious and national values, educating citizens of society as free and responsible citizens [Constitutions of the countries of the world in Russian].

It is interesting to refer to the School Standards Act of 1998 [School Standards and Framework Act, 1998] and the Education Act of 1996 [Education Act, 1996] of Great Britain, according to which the religious component is a mandatory part of all British educational programs. This obligation is reinforced by paragraph 3 of Article 375 of Part 3 of the Education Act of 1996 of the United Kingdom, according to which the British society asserts the need to reflect religious values in every curriculum used. Since the population of this country is mainly Chris-

tians according to their confessional preferences, the document considered above focuses on Christian values, at the same time the importance of studying other religious trends represented in society is also emphasized. Let’s give an example. The document specifies the possibility of performing collective Christian rituals in an educational institution, and specifically stipulates the possibility of replacing Christian prayers with other religious practices.

In modern German legal practice, the control of educational processes by the federal government is constituted, which means, as the Constitution of the State of Hesse states (Article 57.1), that the study of religious doctrines is one of the examples of ordinary educational courses that are equal with other disciplines studied. Educational institutions that provide a body of knowledge in the field of religion must respect the rights of State and public supervision, as well as the rights of the church and religious communities.

A similar picture is observed in the legislation of the states of Bavaria and Hamburg [The Constitution of Bavaria (Federal State of Germany); the Constitution of Hamburg (Federal State of Germany)]. Article 7 § 3 of the Basic Law (Constitution) guarantees, firstly, the study of religious foundations as an ordinary academic subject; secondly, the obligation to study religious foundations as an educational course (an exception is only allowed in relation to schools whose charter defines an educational institution as “non-religious”); thirdly, compliance with the principles is guaranteed religious communities; Fourthly, the provision of control over the quality of teaching by the state is emphasized; and, finally, fifthly, the possibility and right of teachers to be excluded from teaching religious disciplines due to their personal preferences.

Let’s turn to the experience of Spanish educational practices in the field of religion. In the country we are considering, the obligation to teach religious fundamentals is constituted at all levels of education, starting in pre-school institutions and ending with university education as an optional part of the general course. The basis for this practice is Royal Decree 2438, adopted in 1994, according to which all religious organizations operating in Spain in the legal field have a guaranteed opportunity to ensure the process of religious education in all public and private educational institutions. The only condition limiting such activities is the unwillingness of students, their parents or guardians to receive religious knowledge. The high level of teaching of religious knowledge is ensured by the requirements for spe-

cialist teachers, the selection of which is carried out in a two-stage way - first at the level of dioceses, then at the level of the administration of an educational institution [Royal Decree 2438/ 1994]. At the same time, Spain provides for the study of non-religious ethical subjects as an alternative to the teaching of religion, the order of which is defined in the Order of August 3, 1995 of the Royal Decree.

Dutch educational practice in relation to the confessional component of the educational process defines two important provisions: firstly, all educational institutions have the right to teach their students the faith of the confessional creed whose representatives sponsor them; and, secondly, any confessional creed recognized by the state has the right to create its own educational institutions.

The educational practice and the postulates of religion, which have become widespread in Italian lands, are based on the Concordat approved in 1984. In accordance with this document, freedom of religion was established, thereby changing the former comprehensive role of the Roman Catholic faith, which was previously considered state and unified. Article 9.2 of the Concordat in question emphasizes the role of religious values and principles of Catholic doctrine as the basis of Italian culture and the historical heritage of the Italian people. This document guarantees Catholic education in all educational institutions of the country with different categories and degrees of study.

Polish educational practice in relation to the confessional component of the educational process is in many ways similar to previous examples. So, in particular, at the legislative level, the study of the subject "The Law of God" (the religiosity of which follows from the very name of the discipline) is approved as the same compulsory subject, standing on a par with mathematics or the Polish language. At the same time, Polish practice has its own national peculiarities that differ from the previously considered examples. For example, the teaching of religious foundations is carried out according to an alternative principle. In other words, teachers of an educational institution, firstly, have the right to conduct a course in accordance with their religious interests. Secondly, the qualification requirements for specialists are confirmed by church institutions that have previously concluded contractual obligations with the Ministry of National Education and Sports of the Republic of Poland. Thirdly, the possibility of teaching religious fundamentals is ensured by the presence in a classroom or group of at least three students belonging to a single confessional creed.

Fourth, in cases where there are fewer than three representatives of various religious movements in a classroom or group, they can study the religion they are interested in in other groups within the framework of a single school curriculum, attending additional classes in their free time.

At the same time, in the educational practices of democratic European countries, there are also secular systems in which religious organizations are not included in educational processes.

Such examples include Sweden, where religious organizations are excluded from participating in teaching directly, but in general, the dissemination of religious value-moral norms and rules is considered as an essential element of personal growth of students.

We observe similar examples in England and Wales belonging to the so-called "mixed type", which is characterized by the following condition: religious education is mandatory, but it is possible to refuse to receive such an educational package. In other words, in these cases, the choice in teaching certain confessional dogmas may be determined by the presence or absence of a sponsor in the form of a religious organization from an educational institution. For example, the Education Reform Act, adopted in 1988, emphasizes the main objective of education, which is to develop the spiritual, moral, cultural, mental and physical abilities of students. If an educational institution is oriented towards a secular profile, then control over the quality of educational services, the process of training specialists, the development of educational programs is controlled by state structures. If necessary, such educational institutions seek advice from religious organizations or religious figures.

An interesting example of educational practices in relation to the confessional component of the educational process of the Republic of France, which are characterized by a strictly observed and controlled principle of separation of educational institutions from religious provisions. In fairness, we note that such a rule is common only in state educational institutions. In accordance with the Constitutions of France (art. 1) a country is defined as a secular, democratic and social republic that ensures equality before the law for all citizens, regardless of their origin, race or religion. Such an obligation is based on the Constitutional provision on respect for all beliefs [Order 2438/1994]. According to this document, the principle of secularism is central to the system of values formed by the education system, and, therefore, an educational institution should be protected

from religion. At the same time, the French educational space includes a widespread and active network of Catholic schools providing full-fledged religious education.

However, in recent years, the question of including religious information in the public school curriculum has been increasingly raised in French society, which is associated with a huge migration flow to this country. According to many French cultural, political and educational figures, such actions will significantly accelerate the acquaintance of migrant communities with the culture of France. This fact was highlighted in a report on the teaching of subjects related to religious dogmas in Secular schools, prepared by the French Ministry of National Education. Another example of a similar orientation can be called the order of the deputy of the National Assembly of France, by the way, which is important, in the past, the Minister of Culture and Education Jacques Lang, on the introduction of religious studies subjects in educational institutions. These and similar initiatives formed the basis for the creation of the European Institute for the Study of Religion, which today serves as a coordinating center for conducting expert assessments on religious issues.

The understanding of the secularity of the state and, accordingly, the secular nature of education in schools of the Republic of Kazakhstan is enshrined in the Constitution and current legislation in the form of the principle of separating the state system of upbringing and education from religious associations: provisions of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan (1995) concerning religion and law citizens to freedom of conscience, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education”, establishing as one of the principles of state policy in the field of education “secular, humanistic and developing nature of education” (Chapter 1, Article 3), in the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On freedom of religion and religious associations” (15.01.1992), which stipulates that, in accordance with the constitutional principle of separation of religious associations from the state, the state ensures the secular nature of education in state educational institutions (Article 3, paragraph 4), Law RK “On Religious Activity and Religious Associations” (11.10.2011), regulating the procedure for forming activities and activities of religious associations, the Concept of State Policy in the Religious Sphere for 2017-20120 (June 2017), defining the system of official views on improving state-confessional and interfaith relations, the Concept for the Development of Religious (Spiritual) Education until 2020 (2014), which

is the main strategic document aimed at improving the system of religious education along with secular education, the State Program on Counteracting Religious Extremism and Terrorism until 2017 (2013) and a number of other legislative acts having attitude to this area.

The analysis of works devoted to the study of a huge range of issues related to the teaching of confessional disciplines has shown that different terms have a definition similar in content [Kastuganov, 2015; Murtazin, 2015; Abdirayymova, Zharkynbayeva, 2013; Kosichenko, 2013; Shchekin, Zemlyakov, 2009]. At the same time, the same concepts have different meanings and depths from different authors. In addition, with a similar understanding of confessional education, its different structure is distinguished, due to the different emphasis of meanings and values. For example, according to I.V. According to the metric, religious education should be understood as an educational and educational process characterized by such qualities as purposefulness, full consideration of the interests of a person, his family circle, religious communities, society and the state as a whole. I.V. Metlik also emphasizes the importance of the activities of any religion and religious organization based on ideological values [Metlik, 2004: 118].

We propose a definition of confessional education, which, in our opinion, allows us to correctly identify the content of all the main types and forms of religious study: confessional education aims to give students an understanding of their own religious identity, to understand various religious beliefs and practices from an objective and neutral point of view for the development of social tolerance in a democratic context. The proposed terminological definition belongs to the Russian researchers A. Shchekin and I. According to them, confessional education involves providing activities that carry out the dissemination of religious provisions and the transmission of methods of religious practices performed by specialists in the person of confessionally trained priests and religious teachers; a high-quality system of training of pedagogical personnel for the educational institutions of confessional education is also needed [Shchekin, Zemlyakov, 2009: 88].

The practical embodiment of such a distinction is the adoption in scientific discourse of a clear understanding of the concepts: “religious education” and “religious studies education”. In this issue, we share the opinion of Kazakh religious scholar A.G. Kosichenko, who noted that “for Kazakhstan, the problem of teaching the basics of religion (in the

form of the basics of religious studies), or not teaching, remains an open question” [Kosichenko, 2013].

In our opinion, it is necessary to preserve the principle of secularism in the educational sector, which we understand as, first of all, the independence of the educational process from religion. And in this sense, the participants of the educational process will have to answer a difficult question about the correlation of secular and confessional principles in education and upbringing, without contradicting the cultural context of personality formation, leaving the student the opportunity to make his own choice.

Conclusion

An analysis of the qualitative and temporal configurations of secular and confessional education made it possible to trace the line of the content and value growth of education, highlighting the positive aspects and critical points of various approaches. On the other hand, the performed analysis served as a

theoretical and methodological platform for understanding the pedagogical experience and providing an understanding of the construction of the educational paradigm.

A comparative analysis of educational practices common in the field of secular education, which has anthropocentrism as its values, and confessional education, which is formed on the basis of theocentrism, allowed us to come to two main conclusions: 1) in countries with strong religious traditions, religious education cannot be divorced from the general education system; students are required to receive education, of which religious knowledge is a part; other countries, on the contrary, seek to free the educational sphere from the influence of religious institutions; 2) none of the considered models of education exists in its “pure” form; it is not just a theoretical understanding of the educational paradigm, it depends on many socio-cultural factors that must be analyzed and taken into account when planning and implementing changes in this area.

References

- Education Act. (1996). <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1996/1996056.htm>
- Hasenclever A. (2003). *Geteilte Werte – Gemeinsamer Frieden? Überlegungen zur zivilisierenden Kraft von Religionen und Glaubensgemeinschaften* // H. Kung & D. Senghaas (Eds.) *Friedenspolitik: ethische Grundlagen internationaler Beziehungen*, München: Piper.
- Kastuganov T. (2015). *Religioznoe obrazovanie v Kazahstane*. <http://www.niac.gov.kz/ru/religiovedcheskoe-i-religioznye-issledovaniya/item/110-religioznoe-obrazovanie-v-kazahstane>; Murtazin M. (2015). *Razvitie islamskogo religioznogo obrazovaniya na Severnom Kavkaze i v evropejskoj chasti strany: tendencii i perspektivy*. *Materialy nauchno-prakticheskoy konferencii «Jelnokul'turnoe raznoobrazie Rossii kak faktor formirovaniya obshhegrazhdanskoj identichnosti»*. Stavropol. <http://www.kavkazoved.info/news/>; Abdirajymova A.S., Zharkynbaeva R.S. (2013). *Rol' sistemy obrazovaniya v predotvrashhenii projavlennij religioznogo jekstremizma v central'noj Azii*. *Vestnik KazNPU*; Kosichenko A.G. (2013). *Religioznoe soznanie kazahstancsev i problemy sovershenstvovaniya religioznoj politiki v Respublike Kazahstan*. *Sb. materialov nauchno-prakticheskoy konferencii «Sostojavshijsja Kazahstan, ustremlyennij v budushhee»*. Almaty; Shhekin N.S., Zemljakov L.E. (2009). *Social'no-politicheskie osobennosti svetskogo i religioznogo obrazovaniya v Respublike Belarus*. *Problemy upravleniya*. № 4(33).
- Konstitucija Bavarii (federal'naja zemlja FRG); Konstitucija Gamburga (federal'naja zemlja FRG). http://www.1000do-kumente.de/?c=dokument_de&document=0014_gru&object=translation&l=ru
- Konstitucija Francuzskoj Respubliki ot 04.10.1958. <http://worldconstitutions.ru/?p=138>
- Konstitucii stran mira na russkom jazyke. <https://legalns.com>
- Korolevskij dekret 2438/1994 ot 16.12.1994, regulirujushhij porjadok religioznogo obrazovaniya, Prikaz ot 21 sentjabrja 1993 goda, regulirujushhij uchastie prepodavatelej, zanjatyh v prepodavanii religii, v organah upravlenija centrov publicnogo upravlenija.
- Mesto religioznogo obrazovaniya v duhovno-nravstvennom vospitanii (2016). http://islameducation.ru/islamic_pedagogics/place
- Metlik I.V. (2004). *Religija i obrazovanie v svetskoj shkole*. M.: Planeta.
- O ponimanii svetskosti gosudarstva i svetskogo haraktera obrazovaniya v gosudarstvennoj shkole. <http://radonezh.ru/analytics/ponimanijsvetskosti-gosudarstva-i-svetskogo-kharaktera-obrazovaniya-v-gosudarstvennoj-shkole-47684.html>; Ponkin I.V. (2003). *Svoboda sovesti i svetskij karakter obrazovaniya v gosudarstvennyh i municipal'nyh obrazovatel'nyh uchrezhdenijah*. *Gosudarstvennoe stroitel'stvo i pravo*. *Periodicheskoe izdanie nauchnyh trudov kafedry gosudarstvennogo stroitel'stva i prava Rossijskoj akademii gosudarstvennoj sluzhby pri Prezidente Rossijskoj Federacii*. Vypusk 4. Pod obshh. red. G.V. Mal'ceva. M.: Izd-vo Moskovskogo gumanitarnogo universiteta; Bratanovskij S.N., Kocherga S.A. (2017). *Administrativno-pravovye aspekty obrazovatel'noj dejatel'nosti v Rossii; Pravovaja politika v sfere obrazovaniya*. *Slovar*. Pod red. Mal'ko A.V., Smirnova D.A.
- Pavelko N.N., Pavlov S.O. (2013). *Psihologija i pedagogika: uchebnoe posobie*. M.: OOO «KnoRUS».
- Pisenko K.A. (2017). *Uroki religii v gosudarstvennoj shkole – norma svetskogo pravovogo gosudarstva*. *Cerkov' i vremja*. № 51. <https://mospat.ru/church-and-time/431>; Babich D. (2017). *Religija v shkole: mezhduravnodushiem i objazalovkoj*. <https://ria.ru/authors/20120912/748407584.html>; Gurin S. (2017). *Mrakobesie – ili...?* https://scepis.net/library/id_3250.html; Dzhharvis D. (2013). *Religija i religiovedenie v gosudarstvennyh srednih shkolah: sovremennye podhody*. *Religija i pravo*. № 1. <http://www.mhs548.ru/2/10/page6.php>; *Religija v duhe vremeni: spory ob obrazovanii v Anglii* (2015). <http://www.bbc.Com/Russian/uk>;

Zachem cerkov' uporno lezet v shkolu? (2017). <http://genocid.net>; Religija i jetika v shkole: za i protiv /<https://letidor.ru/obrazovanie/a-5-religiya-i-etika-v-shkole-za-i-protiv-10865.shtml> i dr.

Podlasyj I.P. Pedagogika: 100 voprosov – 100 otvetov: uceb. posobie dlja vuzov. (2004). M.: VLADOS-press.

Prkaz ot 03.08.1995, regulirujushhij obrazovatel'nuju dejatel'nost', al'ternativnuju izucheniju religii, ustanovlennuju Korolevskim dekretom 2438/1994. Boletin Oficial del Estado № 209, 1Sept.

Rezoljucija 36/55 General'noj Assamblei ot 25.11.1981. http://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/declarations/relintol.shtml
School Standards and Framework Act (1998). www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1998/19980031.htm

Shhekin N.S., Zemljakov L.E. (2009). Social'no-politicheskie osobennosti svetskogo i religioznogo obrazovanija v Respublike Belarus'. Problemy upravlenija. № 4(33).

Sjurmen F. (2002). Prepodavanie osnov religii v svetskoj sisteme obrazovanija Francii/http://ruskline.ru/monitoring_smi/2002/10/29/prepodavanie_osnov_religii_v_svetskoj_sisteme_obrazovanija_francii/

Zakon Respubliki Kazahstan «Ob obrazovanii». <https://online.zakon.kz>

Литература

Закон Республики Казахстан «Об образовании». <https://online.zakon.kz>

Кастуганов Т. (2015). Религиозное образование в Казахстане. <http://www.niac.gov.kz/ru/religiovedcheskoe-i-religioznye-issledovaniya/item/110-religioznoe-obrazovanie-v-kazahstane>; Муртазин М. (2015). Развитие исламского религиозного образования на Северном Кавказе и в европейской части страны: тенденции и перспективы // Материалы научно-практической конференции «Этнокультурное разнообразие России как фактор формирования общегражданской идентичности». – Ставрополь. www.kavkazoved.info/news/2015/02/12/razvitie-islamskogo-religioznogo-obrazovanija-na-sever-nom-kavkaze-i-v-evropejskoj-chasti-strany-tendencii-i-perspektivy.html; Абдирайымова А.С., Жаркынбаева Р.С. (2013). Роль системы образования в предотвращении проявлений религиозного экстремизма в центральной Азии // Вестник КазНПУ; Косиченко А.Г. (2013). Религиозное сознание казахстанцев и проблемы совершенствования религиозной политики в Республике Казахстан // Сб. материалов научно-практической конференции «Состоявшийся Казахстан, устремленный в будущее». Алматы; Шекин Н.С., Земляков Л.Е. (2009). Социально-политические особенности светского и религиозного образования в Республике Беларусь // Проблемы управления. № 4(33).

Конституция Баварии (федеральная земля ФРГ); Конституция Гамбурга (федеральная земля ФРГ). www.1000dokumente.de/?c=dokument_de&document=0014_gru&object=translation&l=ru

Конституции стран мира на русском языке. <https://legalns.com>

Конституция Французской Республики от 04.10.1958. <http://worldconstitutions.ru/?p=138>

Королевский декрет 2438/1994 от 16.12.1994, регулирующий порядок религиозного образования, Приказ от 21.09.1993, регулирующий участие преподавателей, занятых в преподавании религии, в органах управления центров публичного управления.

Место религиозного образования в духовно-нравственном воспитании. (2016). http://islameducation.ru/islamic_pedagogics/place

Метлик И.В. (2004). Религия и образование в светской школе. – М.: Планета.

О понимании светскости государства и светского характера образования в государственной школе. <http://radone-zh.ru/analytics/o-ponimanii-svetskosti-gosudarstva-i-svetskogo-kharaktera-obrazovanija-v-gosudarstvennoj-shkole-47684.html>; Понкин И.В. (2003). Свобода совести и светский характер образования в государственных и муниципальных образовательных учреждениях // Государственное строительство и право. Периодическое издание научных трудов кафедры государственного строительства и права Российской академии государственной службы при Президенте Российской Федерации. – Выпуск 4 / Под общ. ред. Г.В. Мальцева. – М.: Изд-во Московского гуманитарного университета; Братановский С.Н., Кочерга С.А. (2017). Административно-правовые аспекты образовательной деятельности в России; Правовая политика в сфере образования. Словарь / под ред. Малько А.В., Смирнова Д.А.; Ректор Белгородского госуниверситета предложил преподавать в общеобразовательных школах церковнославянский язык. <http://www.portal-credo.ru/site/?act=news&id=124841> и др.

Павелко Н.Н., Павлов С.О. (2013). Психология и педагогика: учебное пособие. – М.: ООО «КноРус».

Писенко К.А. (2017). Уроки религии в государственной школе – норма светского правового государства // Церковь и время. № 51; Бабич Д. (2017). Религия в школе: между равнодушием и обязловкой. <https://ria.ru/authors/20120912/748407584.html>; Гурин С. (2017). Мракобесие – или...?. https://scepis.net/library/id_3250.html; Джарвис Д. (2013). Религия и религиозоведение в государственных средних школах: современные подходы // Религия и право. № 1; Религия в духе времени: споры об образовании в Англии. (2015). www.bbc.com/Russian/uk; Зачем церковь упорно лезет в школу? (2017). <http://genocid.net>; Религия и этика в школе: за и против. <https://letidor.ru/obrazovanie/a-5-religiya-i-etika-v-shkole-za-i-protiv-10865.shtml> и др.

Подласый И.П. (2004). Педагогика: 100 вопросов – 100 ответов: учеб. пособие для вузов. – М.: ВЛАДОС-пресс.

Приказ от 03.08.1995, регулирующий образовательную деятельность, альтернативную изучению религии, установленную Королевским декретом 2438/1994. Boletin Oficial del Estado № 209, 1 Sept.

Резолюция 36/55 Генеральной Ассамблеи от 25.11.1981. http://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/declarations/relintol.shtml

Сюрмен Ф. (2002). Преподавание основ религии в светской системе образования Франции /http://ruskline.ru/monitoring_smi/
Шекин Н.С., Земляков Л.Е. (2009). Социально-политические особенности светского и религиозного образования в Республике Беларусь // Проблемы управления. № 4(33).

Education Act (1996). <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1996/1996056.htm>

Hasenclever A. (2003). Geteilte Werte – Gemeinsamer Frieden? Überlegungen zur zivilisierenden Kraft von Religionen und Glaubensgemeinschaften // Н. Кунг & Д. Сенгаас (Eds.) Friedenspolitik: ethische Grundlagen internationaler Beziehungen, München: Piper. S. 288-318.

School Standards and Framework Act (1998). www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1998/19980031.htm